

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

<b>Louis Agre <i>et al.</i>,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Plaintiffs,</b>	:	<b>Civil Action No. 2:17-cv-4392</b>
	:	
<b>v.</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Thomas W. Wolf <i>et al.</i>,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Defendants.</b>	:	

**LEGISLATIVE DEFENDANTS' SUPPLEMENT TO THEIR MOTION TO DISMISS  
THE AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Legislative Defendants submit this Supplement to their Motion to Dismiss the Amended Complaint filed on November 22, 2017 (ECF No. 108). On November 7, 2017, the Court granted Plaintiffs “leave to amend their Complaint to add one voter from each Congressional district in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, also by November 17, 2017.” (ECF No. 74).<sup>1</sup> On November 17, 2017, Plaintiffs filed their Amended Complaint. (ECF No. 88). Plaintiff Edwin Gragert is the only Plaintiff identified in the Amended Complaint who allegedly lives in the 10<sup>th</sup> Congressional District. (ECF No. 88).

On November 22, 2017, the Court entered an Order requiring every Plaintiff to appear for a deposition to testify regarding, among other things, the “harm” they have suffered as a result of the 2011 Plan. (ECF 112). That day, Legislative Defendants filed a Motion to Dismiss the Amended Complaint. (ECF No. 108).

<sup>1</sup> The Court’s Order implicitly recognized that, to have standing to challenge Pennsylvania’s 2011 Congressional District Map (the “2011 Plan”) on a statewide basis, Plaintiffs would need to allege that a Plaintiff living in every Congressional District suffered harm as a result of the enactment of the 2011 Plan. (ECF No. 83 at 4).

On November 24, 2017, Plaintiffs for the first time disclosed to Legislative Defendants that Mr. Gragert will be traveling abroad at least until December 8, 2017 and that he will only be available for a deposition via Skype from Argentina. But, under the Hague Convention, Argentina does not allow voluntary depositions to take place in Argentinian territory absent permission. *See* <https://travel.state.gov/content/travel/en/legalconsiderations/judicial/country/argentina.html> (“The taking of voluntary depositions of willing witnesses outside of making a formal request under the Hague Evidence Convention is not permitted in Argentina, regardless of the nationality of the witness.”) (emphasis added). Because there is insufficient time for any party to make a formal request to depose Mr. Gragert in Argentina, a deposition of Mr. Gragert would necessarily violate international and Argentinian law.

Mr. Gragert is therefore not be available for his Court-Ordered deposition.<sup>2</sup> As such, the Amended Complaint should be dismissed as to Mr. Gragert for lack of standing because he cannot demonstrate that he has suffered individualized harm, or otherwise provide his Court-Ordered testimony. And, because Mr. Gragert is the only Plaintiff who lives in the 10<sup>th</sup> Congressional District, Plaintiffs do not have standing to challenge the 2011 Plan on a statewide basis. For this reason, and the other reasons set forth in the Motion to be Dismiss (ECF No. 108), Plaintiffs’ Amended Complaint should be dismissed.

---

<sup>2</sup> Given Mr. Gragert’s anticipated return date, it is also unlikely that he will be available for trial.

Dated: November 27, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

**BLANK ROME LLP**

/s/ Brian S. Paszamant  
BRIAN S. PASZAMANT  
JASON A. SNYDERMAN  
JOHN P. WIXTED  
One Logan Square  
130 N. 18<sup>th</sup> Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
Phone: 215-569-5791  
Facsimile: 215-832-5791  
Email: [Paszamant@blankrome.com](mailto:Paszamant@blankrome.com)  
[Snyderman@blankrome.com](mailto:Snyderman@blankrome.com)  
[JWixed@blankrome.com](mailto:JWixed@blankrome.com)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendant Senator  
Joseph B. Scarnati, III*

**HOLTZMAN VOGEL JOSEFIAK  
TORCHINSKY PLLC**

/s/ Jason Torchinsky  
JASON TORCHINSKY (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
SHAWN SHEEHY (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
45 North Hill Drive, Suite 100  
Warrenton, Virginia 20186  
Phone: 540-341-8808  
Facsimile: 540-341-8809  
Email: [JTorchinsky@hvjt.law](mailto:JTorchinsky@hvjt.law)  
[ssheehy@hvjt.law](mailto:ssheehy@hvjt.law)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendants Senator Joseph  
B. Scarnati, III and Representative Michael C.  
Turzai*

**CIPRIANI & WERNER PC**

/s/ Kathleen Gallagher  
KATHLEEN GALLAGHER  
CAROLYN BATZ MCGEE  
650 Washington Road, Suite 700  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15228  
Phone: 412-563-4978  
Email: [KGallagher@c-wlaw.com](mailto:KGallagher@c-wlaw.com)  
[CMcgee@c-wlaw.com](mailto:CMcgee@c-wlaw.com)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendant  
Representative Michael C. Turzai*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that on November 27, 2017, the foregoing was served upon the following Counsel of Record via the Court's ECF system:

Alice W. Ballard, Esquire  
Law Office of Alice W. Ballard, PC  
123 S. Broad Street, Suite 2135  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19109  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Lisa A. Mathewson, Esquire  
The Law Offices of Lisa A. Mathewson LLC  
123 S. Broad Street, Suite 810  
Philadelphia, PA 19109  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

Michael Persoon, Esquire  
Sean Morales-Doyle, Esquire  
Thomas H. Geoghegan, Esquire  
Despres Schwartz & Geoghegan, Ltd.  
77 W. Washington Street, Suite 711  
Chicago, Illinois 60602  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Brian A. Gordon, Esquire  
Gordon & Ashworth PC  
One Belmont Avenue, Suite 519  
Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania 19004  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Virginia L. Hardwick, Esquire  
Hardwick Benfer, LLC  
179 North Broad Street  
Doylestown, Pennsylvania 18901  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Garen Meguerian, Esquire  
201 Industrial Boulevard, Suite 201  
Paoli, Pennsylvania 19301  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Timothy E. Gates, Esquire  
Pennsylvania Department of State  
Office of Chief Counsel

306 North Office Building  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120  
*Attorneys for Defendant, Pedro Cortes, Secretary of State of Pennsylvania*

Ashton R. Lattimore, Esquire  
Mark A. Aronchick, Esquire  
Claudia DePalma, Esquire  
Michele D. Hangley, Esquire  
Hangley Aronchick Segal & Pudlin  
One Logan Square, 27<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
*Attorneys for Defendants, Thomas W. Wolf, Governor of Pennsylvania; Pedro A. Cortés, Secretary of State of Pennsylvania; and Jonathan M. Marks, Commissioner for the Bureau of Commissions, Elections, and Legislation, in their official capacities*

Gregory George Schwab, Esquire  
Governor's Office of General Counsel  
333 Market Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101  
*Attorneys for Defendant, Governor Thomas Wolf*

Dated: November 27, 2017

/s/ Brian S. Paszamant  
BRIAN S. PASZAMANT